

5. Reflecting on TEACHER ROLE AND PEDAGOGY (coded DARK GREEN in the 2014 report)

	<b><i>Pedagogical Issues/Learning Issues (numbers in the left hand column correspond to the 2014 report)</i></b>	<b><i>Question</i></b>	<b><i>Suggestions/Discussion/recommendation</i></b>
1	An important role for music teachers is to be able to develop and challenge pupils' experience of different styles and genres of music and to link these to practical music-making and composing.	How can teachers make links between music that is new and challenging for pupils and their composing activities?	Our main role as teachers of musical composition is to educate our students' sonic sensibilities: the key way to do this is through the design and implementation of authentic, open-ended compositional tasks mediated by appropriate technologies.  Sounds themselves can be explored, using both acoustic and ICT sources.
2	A role for music teachers is to understand the musical needs of individual pupils and know when and how to challenge and nurture their composing abilities.	What is familiar to the pupils in <i>this</i> school? What is unfamiliar? What will stretch them?	Engaging and educating for the 'unfamiliar' takes time and energy; students will need to be challenged and nurtured in equal measure.
3	As well as having excellent musical skills and knowledge of music, teachers need to know how to teach their subject.	What do you teach? How do you teach it? Why do you teach it?	As with all music teaching, developing a skilful pedagogy is the absolute key to ensuring the best quality process and product.  "There is no curriculum development without teacher development" (Stenhouse in Silbeck, 1993)
4	The role of the teacher is one of a guide and educator, not just facilitating fun and learning about what pupils know they like.	How can students be challenged to unpick their intellectual assumptions about what music is and how it is represented?	Asking this question can stretch pupil thinking. Can be incorporated into KS3 (and KS4) lessons from the outset.

5	The role of the teacher as someone who can guide pupils through the process of music education. The creation of an environment within the music department whereby all professionals are contributing to a student's musical development in a holistic way.	How can students be encouraged to move outside their own musical comfort zone and current experience as instrumentalists and embrace alternative models of musical composition?	Ask instrumental teachers to undertake composing activities during instrumental lessons.
7	Pupils and their teachers (through their own educational experiences) often engage in music education first through learning an instrument.	How can these (often very well developed) skills as performers be used to assist their subsequent development as composers?	Use students' experience as musical performers to frame their emerging experiences as composers; musical performance and composition should be taught in a holistic way whenever possible.  Composing becomes a regular part of teaching and learning in music lessons from the earliest stages.
12	Pupils can find it difficult to develop their initial compositional ideas.	How can teachers support pupils' development of strategies for developing compositional ideas?	Scaffolding and framing a compositional task are important once students have been given time and space to explore it for themselves.  Ofsted: "Do more of less".
13	At first sight the popular music experience of a class might seem very distant from contemporary art music. Common formal structures such as periodic phrasing, harmonic conventions, extended phrases and developmental variation are frequently not found in contemporary art music.	How can teachers help their pupils to make links between the two musical genres in a way that facilitates understanding and enjoyment?	The conceptual focus and use of metaphors to determine structure might provide the bridge between popular music and pupils' personal expression. The use of metaphor, often the title of the piece and an abstraction, may be capable of resonating in multiple directions for the imaginative listener, and may provide the bridge to comprehension and understanding.  Choose listening examples of music from the outset, which challenge pupil views of music.

14 & 2 & 17	Pupils often need strategies for developing their material when composing.	How can music teachers help their pupils develop strategies for developing their compositions?	Structure of music is amenable to ready teacher description. Explore how musical structure involves developing material, as well as generation of ideas.  Extract materials and compositional strategies from established contemporary works. Work intensively with pupils to assimilate the new material and explore unfamiliar compositional strategies.
17	Pupils often need strategies for approaching their compositions as a process (and certainly not view it as an instantaneous flash of inspiration).	How can music teachers help their pupils develop strategies for developing their compositions?	Composing is complex - it needs teaching as a series of stages. Teaching it in a series of stages helps break down the composing process, making it easier for pupils to conceptualise.  Plan lessons on: Idea generation; musical organisation; assembling piece; practising in sections; how to structure a piece of music.  Composing pedagogy: Composing needs deconstructing so pupils view it as a <i>process</i> which has stages, not treated as single closed edifice, but one which is amenable to intervention.
49	Pupils often need strategies for approaching their composition as a process: Getting started.	How can sounds be generated and starting points for compositions be found?	Valuing pupil contributions is a crucial part of evaluation especially at the beginning of the composing process. Sometimes using an external generative system, for example magic squares to generate melodies, removes the ideas from the personal, and, therefore, if the results are not immediately felt to be useful, the problem can be located with the system rather than the individual.  How can sounds be generated? Dice? Mozart game? Letters from poems? 'Taking a note for a walk'. Try different starting points with different lessons.
14 & 2 & 17	Pupils often need strategies for approaching their composition as a process: Structuring compositions	How can pupils structure their musical ideas?	Structure of music is amenable to ready teacher description. Explore how musical structure involves developing material, as well as generation of ideas.  Extract materials and compositional strategies from established contemporary works. Work intensively with pupils to assimilate the new material and explore unfamiliar compositional strategies.

26	Composing (like the whole music curriculum!) should be taught musically. (see Ofsted 2012)	What words are needed to talk about music? Are these needed to think about music?	<p>Old National Curriculum terminology = 'appraising'; lessons on music terminologies in use. There are opportunities for good teacher modelling here.</p> <p>Take pupils inside a composer's way of thinking, their values and aesthetic commitments through intensive musical workshopping using the language and syntax of composers . This is a critical part of the process of opening of minds to the unfamiliar and making it relevant to pupil's learning. Pupils learn how to think inside musical processes as part of their developing composing practice.</p> <p><i>'Everybody in our class can now listen to Gadget and get their head around it and get into the music. Once you have got your head around the language, once you have done this then you enjoy it.'</i> Pupil</p>
34	The music teacher has a role in helping pupils make unfamiliar music relevant to their own music-making.	How can teachers facilitate this process?	<p>Pupils bring their own musical experiences into any given composing task. When presented with and immersed in unfamiliar music, material and processes, pupils make it relevant through appropriation and assimilation.</p> <p>Challenging questioning on simple music, as well as more complex types.</p>
36	Teachers should encourage pupils' engagement and ownership of the composing process whilst not "giving in" to only offering activity in styles and genres that pupils already know they like.	How to do this? And why is it important?	<p>Aim to make authentic connections - play to your strengths as a composer/teacher - try to follow the creative methods or starting points as closely as possible.</p> <p>And why is this important? cf the role of music educators not being here to entertain but to provide a broad and balanced education...</p>
38	Pupil Voice and ownership of the composing process is essential if pupils are to be engaged in the activity.	How can music teachers encourage Pupil Voice whilst exploring unfamiliar styles and genres?	<p>From the outset, music is experienced as a 'meant offering'. Rather than criticise, develop critique as mode of classroom talk.</p> <p>Create a democratic space in the classroom where all ideas are welcome and shared. Give pupils permission to try things and brainstorm ideas openly. In a safe space allow them to generate multiple ideas to both narrowly defined and open-ended activities. The creative ensemble format provides a critical starting point for the development of ideas.</p>

49	Teachers have a vital role to play through knowing the musical interests and developmental needs of their pupils.	How can music teachers ensure that each pupil's musical needs are catered for within the group?	<p>Differentiation by task.</p> <p>Give pupils individual composing tasks/commissions based on knowledge of pupils previous work. Make them specifically tailored and designed to meet the interests and needs of each pupil, which expand upon their own sound vocabulary. These could be made more personal by being delivered in named envelopes. Exam board criteria can provide a frame, but within that individual foci can be maintained.</p>
32	<p>Performing and composing can be linked as activities.</p> <p>The teacher has an important role in setting up an environment where all pupils can make a valid contribution.</p>	How can teachers create an environment where pupils can work together in a democratic and collaborative environment?	<p>Whole class improvisation and performing lessons:</p> <p>Work with pupils as a whole class creative ensemble. This can allow pupils to develop complex levels of musical and social knowledge and roots music as an inherently collaborative social art. The creative ensemble format provides a critical starting point for the development of ideas and the challenges of judging the value and worthiness of ideas.</p>
33	The music teacher can have a role as a facilitator and musical band leader, modeling musical processes.	How to organise group work: What are the 'ground rules' for successful group work? In <i>this</i> school? In <i>this</i> class?	<p>Have some lessons working as a group.</p> <p>The creative ensemble workshop format positions composing as an activity of experimenting, trialing, exploring, developing and combining ideas. These practices are characterised by processes which are relational, and beholden to the participatory skills, interests, enthusiasms and performance possibilities of a particular class. Teachers/composers can use this format to model open-ended participatory exploratory processes which reflect the real world practices of many contemporary composers.</p> <p>Engaging in these processes can provide a bridge between group work and individual composing work.</p>
34	Use of ICT to assist in the assessment process.	How can pupils be engaged in their own assessment of their musical learning and that of others?	<p>Record - and playback - what pupils produce regularly, not only at the end of a project.</p> <p>Use technology such as iPads and sound recorders to record and share work-in-progress, and to revisit old and new drafts. It also means that a wide range of exemplars at different stages of the process can be saved for future use.</p>

35	The teacher is an often under-exploited musical resource in the classroom.	Do your pupils know what instruments you play and do you actively model musical skills, language and ideas yourself?	Remember that you can be and are a model to the pupils of what a contemporary composer can be.  <i>'The composer provided a model of a contemporary eclectic creative individual – an inspired, enthusiastic, engaged contemporary composer whose taste spanned a wellspring of styles and an expansive range of musical genres. He didn't portray himself as the exceptional creative genius but rather acted as a collaborator and facilitator...who modelled composing as an activity and a process, and valued the emerging music as music emerging'.</i>
36	Composing is a process that requires the development of strategies and skills in order that pupils can progress.	How can pupils be encouraged to develop as composers?	Composing is a process that needs daily practice. Encourage pupils to compose something every day even if very short.  Encourage sonic notebooks. Possible use for ICT here.
37	Pupils (understandably) feel vulnerable when offering up initial, fragile musical ideas. These ideas need to be given the space, time and support in order that they can be developed.	How can teachers provide an environment where pupils are willing to offer musical ideas and develop them?	Creative music classroom are places where risk-taking can be undertaken safely. Ideas are valued.  Critique, not criticize.
39	Pupils will be more engaged in the compositional process if their intentions are understood and if they are listened to. Teachers need to create an environment where this can happen.	How can intentionality be built into the composing process? Ie how can pupils be encouraged to think about what they want to do, how they are going to do it and then reflect on their work?	Give the pupils time to think about and discuss their composing intentions before starting. Think about using the schools intranet for these discussions. This allows the pupils to support each other, make comments and suggest ideas to their peers and refine their ideas. It can create a sense of community, create cohesion in the group and allow them to critique their work outside of the classroom. Not only is this useful to the pupils but also to the teacher, allowing them to have a clear idea of what inspires their pupils and to support their planning.  <i>'Because many of them used quite emotive adjectives, there was a certain understood language that they created themselves about the kind of pieces they wanted to write' – This gave the composers an understanding of their personal language from the inside which informed the way they got the pupils to think about their work and the language they then used to talk to the pupils.'</i>  This may seem like time away from composing <i>per se</i> , but remember the Ofsted notion of 'do more of less'.

			After lesson, pupils 'thought out loud' using intranet
40	The role of the teacher in encouraging pupils to think about their musical intentions throughout a composing project.	As above	<p>Allow the pupils to learn by finding out in advance about the topic. This enables those who know already to find out more, and those who know little to start appropriately.</p> <p>Encourage pupils to do research as a pre-composing task. This encourages peer-to-peer learning, pools existing pupil knowledge and allows the teacher to build upon pupil prior knowledge. For example, pupils knew they would be composing for a solo saxophone before they started. Using the internet they were able to source information about the possibilities of the instrument (range, extended techniques etc.) the kind of music it performed and the performer who they were writing for.</p>
41	Questioning is a key skill for teachers employ in lessons. The kinds of questions asked are important if teachers are to move away from “task management” to developing pupils’ Higher Order Thinking Skills and facilitating the development of their intentionality.	How can teachers guide their pupils towards Higher Order Thinking Skills?	<p>Plan for questioning in advance. Use open-ended questions. Aim for higher order thinking.</p> <p>Be aware of the kinds of questions that you ask. A key part of questioning is working with pupils to uncover their intentions for the music they have planned. Questioning should be aimed at moving learners towards the higher stages of Bloom's taxonomy. The higher order thinking stages are concerned with involving pupils in evaluation, synthesis, and analysis. The revised version of the taxonomy (Anderson et al 2001) is even more appropriate for us here as it places creating at the tip of the taxonomy, followed by evaluating and analysing. Whichever is used, it is important to move away from base level ‘remembering’ type questions, and onto ones which engage the pupils with HOTS (higher order thinking skills).</p>
42	In Listen Imagine Compose, composers often talked with pupils about musical and compositional aspects. Teachers were often concerned with task completion.	How can teachers plan their questioning to help pupils develop their composing?	<p>Different kinds of teacher/composer -pupil conversations and interactions might include <b>Questions, Evaluative Comments and Statements.</b></p> <p>Effective <b>questions</b> might start with 'What would happen if...', 'What about...', 'I wondered if...', 'I think you could...', 'You could try...', 'I think that.....'. Here the teacher/composer frames his or her ideas for the pupil in the form of questions rather than directly saying 'do this...'. Framing them in a way in which pupil intentionality remains to the fore, in which the teacher/composer acts as a ‘sounding board’.</p> <p><b>Evaluative comments</b> might start with ‘I like...’, ‘Good idea...’.</p> <p><b>Statements</b> might start with ‘I notice that...’, ‘You are quite clear about that....’. What we are doing is asking the pupil to evaluate what they have done and why they have done it, and what they think they have done. And looking essentially at what ways they think they can improve it and facilitating this process.</p>

			Asking good questions is a skill, it may be useful to have some question stems (as above) on which to add finishing phrases as appropriate. Planning for questioning and commenting may seem excessive, but it helps in the early stages of developing this work, and of taking pupil thinking forwards.
43	There is a tendency for teacher-pupil interactions to focus on keeping pupils on task and moving towards the completion of composing projects. Make sure that this is balanced with conversations that focus on pupil ideas, on process, and on what the pupils are trying to achieve. Remember that the music teacher is a musician in the classroom too!	As above: How can teachers plan their questioning to help pupils develop their composing?	The teacher needs to think about what they say, and what the purpose of the talk is.
45	In Listen Imagine Compose, some action research projects had access to professionals who performed pupils' compositions. Teachers potentially have access to such performers through a variety of means: themselves, a visiting instrumental teacher, an enthusiastic amateur/parent, a professional from a local ensemble, a pupil from the class in question, or from higher up the school) .	How can teachers make best use of a performer whilst guiding the composing process?	<p>The process of composing should make the performance of final product more informed.</p> <p>Just as questioning by the teacher/composer of the pupils should be about uncovering their intentions, the performer's questions are aimed at uncovering their performance intentions. The questions could be asked by the performer, or the teacher could model their questioning on behalf of the performer (particularly if it's a student performer).</p> <p><i>'The first job is to be sure, as a player, that I am seeing the specific, objective instructions - pitches, rhythms, articulations, and dynamics - correctly; then I could work toward the more subjective things that might be implied by the score.'</i></p> <p>Typical first level questions might be 'What is this note?', 'You had a sharp there, shall I carry it forward to this point too?', 'How fast does it go?'. This might move onto 'What does this mean, can you tell me?'.  <i>'It is the player's job not just to play the specifics accurately but also to find this implied potential and make it a reality. With such young composers, often their pieces had a potential of which they weren't 100% aware and which wasn't always intended. And sometimes because scores were unfinished, they could imply various potentials. So by asking these questions I could zero in on what it was intended a bit better. And if the answers were vague or unsure, I could demonstrate a few different potentials and that might help them decide or be clearer in their imaginations about their creations, and help them see perhaps by notating more specifically in one way or another they might communicate their intention to the player more clearly and then have a better chance of having a real performance get close to matching</i></p>

			<p><i>their imagination.</i>' Professional performer</p> <p>There are more nuggets focusing on working with expert performers in a separate resource (no. 8).</p>
47	Some pupils are more skilled than others at expressing ideas and knowledge verbally. This may especially be the case when talking about musical ideas.	How can teachers assess ideas and learning with pupils who are not adept and/or confident verbally?	<p>Some young people will find it easier than others to verbalise their ideas and learning. Be aware of the danger of assuming pupils don't have the necessary knowledge just because they don't have the language to express it.</p> <p>One way around this might be to ask the pupils to show instead of tell. 'Play it to me, don't talk about it'</p>
48	Young people are used to being presented in popular music culture with fully-formed musical artefacts in which the processes are often invisible. Frequently, the impression is given that the process involved in creating a piece of music was simply getting together and having a jam. This could be one of the factors that makes young people, who can be advanced musically, reluctant to stick with or develop their initial exploratory ideas, often dismissing or discarding them if they are not of the highest rank.	How can teachers encourage pupils to stick with and value their own initial ideas and contributions?	<p>Composing is complex - it needs teaching as a series of stages. Plan lessons on: Generation; organisation; assembling piece; practising in sections.</p> <p>Encourage pupils to stick with and value their own initial ideas and contributions.</p> <p>Valuing pupil contributions is a crucial part of evaluation especially at the beginning of the composing process. Sometimes using an external generative system, for example magic squares to generate melodies, removes the ideas from the wholly personal, and, therefore, if the results are not immediately felt to be useful, the problem can be located with the system rather than the individual.</p> <p>How can sounds be generated? Dice? Mozart game? Letters from poems? 'Taking a note for a walk'. Try different starting points with different lessons</p>
50	Learning and doing are different but inter-related. Teachers need to differentiate between the two when planning and reflecting on their lessons.	What do we want pupils to learn and what should they do in order to learn?	<p>When planning and reflecting on lessons, it is useful to ask these questions: What do want the pupils to <i>learn</i>? What do you think they did learn? Are these different?</p> <p>Do not assume that just because 'doing' is taking place that the pupils are therefore learning.</p>

51	Composing entails the use of higher order thinking skills which are valuable to the young person's cognitive development and transferable across the curriculum (and beyond).	How can teachers facilitate their pupils to use higher order thinking skills?	Use the revised version of Blooms Taxonomy for questioning with musical examples.  See item 42
52	Composing (like the whole music curriculum!) should be taught musically (see Ofsted 2012)	How can teachers evaluate and assess in a musical fashion?	Discussion lessons from early stages - what makes a good piece of music? Whose judgments matter? How do we rate music? What do our own judgments rely on?  Music learning evaluation can take place in a musical fashion and is often embedded in many workshop style learning processes, in particular, when working as a whole class/group creative ensemble. For example, <i>'non-verbal evaluation can happen through affirmation of an idea, through playing it back, building on it, suggesting a change, restarting a piece from one idea and letting it develop in a constructive new way and allows feedback to be given without the person receiving it losing face'</i> (Composer). Making these processes visible to pupils teachers/composers can help pupils can gain an awareness of their own artistic judgements. Pupils develop the ability to make musical judgements in a musical fashion.
53	Pupils need to develop an ability to evaluate their own work to support the development of their own musical voices and artistic intent.	How can teachers support their pupils in evaluating their own work?	Develop criteria for quality with the pupils. 'In this project a good one will...'. Or maybe <i>post hoc</i> : 'A good one has...'  Support pupils to develop their own criteria for evaluation of their work. Help them to make these specific and continually feed this back into the ongoing refinement and rehearsal of the music.  <i>'Pupils need to learn concepts by which to measure, for example, consonance/dissonance, expressive value of intervals, tightness (were we all together?)'. This will enable them to create their own criteria and concepts for evaluation. By doing this they will begin to carve out their own artistic intent, and clarity of style'</i> . (Composer)
54	The ability to self evaluate is crucial for creative solo or group composition tasks.	How can teachers support their pupils in evaluating their own work?	Ask pupils to set themselves targets. Discuss with them if they have met them. Be rigorous in revisiting these.  When we hear refinement happening (e.g. speed, degree of detail, degree of change) we are witnessing progression.

55	The ability to self evaluate is key to pupils' ability to develop and progress as composers.	How can teachers support their pupils in evaluating their own work?	<p>One of the most effective ways a teacher/composer can support pupils evaluating their own work is through the teacher/composer making their own thinking and decision making visible to the pupils.</p> <p>What does 'liking something' mean? Use lessons for pupils to produce music which they revise (See items 21 &amp; 26) but then discuss <i>why</i> revisions took place.</p> <p>Good questions to guide the discussion include: Why do they choose a particular musical idea as a starting point?, How do they know it has potential for development?, why do they choose to move to or bring in another idea at a particular point? How are they evaluating as they go along?</p>
----	--	---	--