3. Reflecting on PUPIL OWNERSHIP AND THE COMPOSING PROCESS (coded ORANGE in the 2014 report)

	Pedagogical Issues/Learning Issues (numbers in the left hand column correspond to the 2014 report)	Question	Suggestions/Discussion
18	Pupils often have little or no experience of contemporary art music and can at first sight seem far away from their popular music experience. For example, common formal structures such as periodic phrasing, harmonic conventions, extended phrases and developmental variation are frequently not found in contemporary art music.	How can connections be made between students' popular music experience and contemporary art music and therefore support their ownership of composing such music?	A conceptual focus and use of metaphors to determine structure might provide the bridge between popular music and pupils' personal expression. The use of metaphor, often the title of the piece or an abstraction, may be capable of resonating in multiple directions for the imaginative listener, and may provide the bridge to comprehension and understanding. Choose listening examples of music from the outset, which challenge pupil views of music and make unusual connections.
24	There is a lot of discussion in music education about whether pupils, when composing, should start with what they know and their own musical experiences and what existing, often unfamiliar, musics/repertoire might offer pupils composing.	How do pupils build bridges between music they know and unfamiliar musics?	Pupils bring their own musical experiences into any given composing task. When presented with and immersed in unfamiliar music, material and processes, pupils will make it relevant through appropriation and assimilation.
27	Contemporary art music is often dismissed as irrelevant to young people, especially those studying at secondary school. Some approaches, such as Musical Futures, advocate starting with what the pupils know and building from there.	How do we make contemporary art music relevant to pupils?	'Relevance' is created by the participants and in particular through the ethos generated by the workshop leader/teacher. Hand over the tools for creativity; experimenting, playing, exploring, relating to personal experience. Don't worry about relevance! It's the empowerment and opportunity to create / hear / understand that will make it relevant.
30	Pupil ownership of the composing process is frequently ignored and can lead to disengagement.	How can we support pupil ownership of the composing process?	Create a democratic space in the classroom where all ideas are welcome and shared. Give pupils permission to try things and brainstorm ideas openly. In a safe space allow them to generate multiple ideas to both narrowly defined and open-ended activities.



			Rather than criticise, develop critique as mode of classroom talk.
			Use the creative ensemble format as a starting point for the development of ideas.
14	In some contexts pupils can be much more familiar with composing using digital technologies/software than with traditional instruments.	How can we support students to make connections between what they know (composing using digital technologies) and less familiar musics?	Plan for learning using a range of resources available in school. Link together conventional instruments with digital technologies whenever possible. This allows for students to make connections between what they know and what they are being encouraged to know.
15	Performance and composition are often taught as separate entities with performance being the dominant experience of pupils.	Can pupil ownership of the composing process be supported by their experience as performers?	Use students' experience as musical performers to frame their emerging experiences as composers. Musical performance and composition should be taught in a holistic way whenever possible.
31	Composing tasks for pupils are often generic and do not take into account the needs, abilities and existing knowledge of individual pupils.	How can we support individual pupils progression as composers within the confines of the curriculum?	Give pupils individual composing tasks/commissions based on knowledge of pupils previous work. Make them specifically tailored and designed to meet the interests and needs of each pupil, which expand upon their own sound vocabulary. These could be made more personal by being delivered in named envelopes. Exam board criteria can provide a frame, but within that individual foci can be maintained.
39	Frequently very little time is given for pupils to consider what they would like to compose. This runs contrary to how a professional composer might work and does not encourage pupil ownership of the composing process.	How can we encourage pupils to develop their musical imaginations and have clear ideas of what they want to compose?	Give the pupils time to think about and discuss their composing intentions before starting. Think about using the schools intranet for these discussions. This allows the pupils to support each other, make comments and suggest ideas to their peers and refine their ideas. This can create a sense of community, create cohesion in the group and allow them to critique their work outside of the classroom. This may seem like time away from composing per se, but remember the Ofsted notion of 'do more of less'.
40	Often, composing tasks are planned without teachers understanding what pupils already	How can teachers build on and plan based on what pupils	Allow the pupils to learn by finding out in advance about the topic. This enables those who know already to find out more, and those who know



	know or have the potential to find out for themselves.	already know or can find out for themselves?	Iittle to start appropriately. Encourage pupils to do research as a pre-composing task. This encourages peer-to-peer learning, pools existing pupil knowledge and allows the teacher to build upon pupil prior knowledge. E.g. pupils knew they were composing for a solo saxophone before they started. Using the internet they were able to source information about the possibilities of the instrument (range, extended techniques etc.) the kind of music it performed and the performer who they were writing for.
45	Expert performers, whether professional visiting musicians, peripatetic teachers or music teachers can be an excellent composing resource for pupils and support their development and identification as as composers as opposed to being performer and composer.	What role can expert performers play in supporting independent learning and pupil ownership?	Performer talks with pupils about their intentionality. Pupils working with a professional musician can use them to figure out ideas, explore different options through giving the performer specific instructions. This fosters independent learning and adds a level of excitement at hearing their music played by an experienced performer. 'It became a piece in its own right, even if it wasn't how I initially wanted it to sound, it became something different, which I was pleased with.' Pupil
53	Evaluation and assessment can often be a top-down and imposed process.	How can we support pupil ownership of the evaluation process and support the ongoing independent critical reflection of their work and their development as composers?	Develop criteria for quality with the pupils. 'In this project a good one will'. Or maybe post hoc: 'A good one has' Support pupils to develop their own criteria for evaluation of their work. Help them to make these specific and continually feed this back into the ongoing refinement and rehearsal of the music. 'Pupils need to learn concepts by which to measure, for example, consonance/dissonance, expressive value of intervals, tightness (were we all together?)'. This will enable them to create their own criteria and concepts for evaluation. By doing this they will begin to carve out their own artistic intent, and clarity of style'. (Composer)



54	The ability to self evaluate is crucial for	How can we support pupils own	Ask pupils to set themselves targets. Discuss with them if they have met	
	creative solo or group composition tasks and	critical reflection skills?	them. Be rigorous in revisiting these.	
	for pupils independence as composers.			

