

2. Reflecting on EVALUATION AS PART OF THE COMPOSING PROCESS (coded RED in the 2014 report)

	<i>Pedagogical Issues/Learning Issues (numbers in the left hand column correspond to the 2014 report)</i>	<i>Question</i>	<i>Suggestions/Discussion/recommendation</i>
34	As music is a sound based art form, unless written down, it is difficult for pupils to revisit, evaluate and refine from class to class.	What is the role of recording in supporting evaluation?	<p>Use technology such as iPads and sound recorders to record and share work-in-progress, and to revisit old and new drafts. Do this regularly, not only at the end of a project.</p> <p>This also means that you can collect a wide range of exemplars at different stages of the process can be saved for future use.</p>
42	When teachers circulate around a classroom to support pupils composing, conversations can tend towards those that concern task completion. However, it was observed that when composer's circulated they tended to talk more about the compositional aspects.	How can the most effective use of teacher/composer - pupil conversations be made?	<p>Teacher/composer -pupil conversations and interactions might include Questions, Evaluative Comments and Statements.</p> <p>Effective questions might start with 'What would happen if...', 'What about...', 'I wondered if...', 'I think you could...', 'You could try...', 'I think that.....'. Here the teacher/composer frames his or her ideas for the pupil in the form of questions rather than directly saying 'do this...'. Framing them in a way in which pupil intentionality remains to the fore, in which the teacher/composer acts as a 'sounding board'.</p> <p>Evaluative comments might start with 'I like...', 'Good idea...'. </p> <p>Statements might start with 'I notice that...', 'You are quite clear about that....'. <i>'What we are doing is asking the pupil to evaluate what they have done and why they have done it, and what they think they have done. And looking essentially at what ways they think they can improve it and facilitating this process.'</i> Asking good questions is a skill, it may be useful to have some question stems (as above) on which to add finishing phrases as appropriate. Planning for questioning and commenting may seem excessive, but it helps in the early stages of developing this work, and of taking pupil thinking forwards.</p>

49	At the beginning of the composing process pupils' ideas are often fragile. They can be very self critical of their ideas which can lead to them being easily discarded by pupils.	Is it useful to and, in what ways can we depersonalize evaluation at the start of the composing process and therefore encourage pupils to stick with their initial ideas?	<p>Valuing pupil contributions is a crucial part of evaluation especially at the beginning of the composing process.</p> <p>Sometimes using an external generative system, for example magic squares to generate melodies, removes the ideas from the personal, and, therefore, if the results are not immediately felt to be useful, the problem can be located with the system rather than the individual.</p> <p>Sounds and initial musical ideas can be generated by range of different means e.g. Dice? Mozart game? Letters from poems? 'Taking a note for a walk'. Try different starting points with different lessons.</p>
52	Evaluation can often be thought of as something that is separate from the act of making/creating music, something which just involves words and which happens at the end of the process.	What place is there for non-verbal evaluation of musical ideas, how does this take place and how can it be embedded into the composing process?	<p>Music learning evaluation can take place in a musical fashion and is often embedded in many workshop style learning processes, in particular, when working as a whole class/group creative ensemble. One composer stated:</p> <p><i>'Non-verbal evaluation can happen through affirmation of an idea, through playing it back, building on it, suggesting a change, restarting a piece from one idea and letting it develop in a constructive new way and allows feedback to be given without the person receiving it loosing face'</i> (Composer).</p> <p>It is important for teachers/composers to make these processes visible to pupils. This can help pupils gain an awareness of their own artistic judgments. Pupils develop the ability to make musical judgments in a musical fashion.</p>
53	The question 'what makes a successful/good/quality composition?' is a difficult and often a subjective one. Pupils are not often invited to be part of this discussion and are not encouraged to develop their own independent success criteria, which they can carry (and develop) from project to project, and instead rely on external judgments from their teachers or exam boards.	How can we support pupils developing their own success criteria?	<p>Support pupils to develop their own success criteria for their work. Help them to make these specific and continually feed this back into the ongoing refinement and rehearsal of the music:</p> <p><i>'Pupils need to learn concepts by which to measure, for example, consonance/dissonance, expressive value of intervals, tightness (were we all together?)'. This will enable them to create their own criteria and concepts for evaluation. By doing this they will begin to carve out their own artistic intent, and clarity of style'</i>. (Composer)</p> <p>Develop criteria for quality with the pupils. 'In this project a good one will...'. Or maybe <i>post hoc</i>: 'A good one has...'</p> <p>Include discussions in lessons from early stages about what makes a good piece of music? Whose judgments matter? How do we rate music? What do our own judgments rely on?</p>

54	The ability to self-evaluate is crucial for creative solo or group composition tasks. It is when we hear refinement happening (e.g. speed, degree of detail, degree of change) and are able to witness progression.	How can we develop self-evaluation tools in pupils?	Ask pupils to set themselves targets. Discuss with them if they have met them. Be rigorous in revisiting these.
55	Pupils can often lack strategies for self-evaluation of their music and the necessary vocabulary and tools to share this.	What pedagogical strategies can teachers use to support pupil's evaluating their own work?	<p>Make your own thinking and decision making visible to the pupils. For example, share:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • why you have chosen a particular musical idea as a starting point • how you know it has potential for development • why you have chosen to move to or bring in another idea at a particular point <p>Discover how your pupils are evaluating as they go along. What does 'liking something' mean to them?</p> <p>Include lessons for pupils to produce music which they revise but then discuss <i>why</i> revisions took place.</p>